PERSONNEL BOARD - APPEAL HEARING MINUTES MONDAY, March 21, 2016 6:00 P.M.

PRESENT: Pat Carnevale, Chairperson; Norberto Alvarez, Vice-Chairperson; Zoraya Pena, Member; Stephen Dielmann, Member; Luis Zubieta, Member; **ALSO PRESENT**: Lorena Bravo, City Attorney; Gelien Perez, HR Director; Owen Kohler, Assistant City Attorney; and Annette Otaño, Secretary.

Hearing requested by Officer Juan Iglesias to discuss the following item:

20 HOUR SUSPENSION

Lorena Bravo, Acting City Attorney, had all those in attendance that may be called to testify to stand and swore them in.

The parties submitted the following exhibits marked and entered into evidence:

PBA Exhibits (submitted by Luis Fusté, PBA Attorney)

- 1. Copy of HPD Departmental Manual (section regarding Traffic Law Enforcement)
- 2. Copy of Florida Statues, Title XXIII, Chapter 316 (State Uniform Traffic Control)
- 3. Copy of Juan M. Iglesias' performance appraisal for the rating period of July 16, 2014 to July 16, 2015.
- 4. Copy of Written Counseling Memorandum for Officer Thomas Peluso regarding "low traffic productivity performance" dated August 9, 2015.
- 5. Copy of Written Counseling Memorandum for Officer Edgardo Matos regarding "performing below the Departmental expectation in the area of traffic enforcement," dated August 11, 2015.
- 6. Copy of "Disciplinary Notice" (20 Hrs Suspension) for Officer Juan Iglesias regarding "Traffic Law Enforcement" dated August 13, 2015.
- 7. Copy of Sergeant Jean Dipietro email to Commander Orlando Sal vat regarding Officer Juan Iglesias action plan.
- 8. Copy of "Disciplinary Notice" (20 Hrs Suspension) for Officer Juan Iglesias regarding "Traffic Law Enforcement, Department Manual, Attention to Duty, Duty Responsibilities" dated November 9, 2015.
- 9. Copy of "Disciplinary Notice" (Written Reprimand) for Officer Edgardo Matos regarding "Traffic Law Enforcement/Attention to Duty" dated December 28, 2015.
- 10. Copy of "Disciplinary Notice" (10 Hrs Suspension) for Officer Juan Masso regarding "Traffic Law Enforcement" dated February 9, 2016.

City of Hialeah Exhibits (submitted by Owen Kohler, City of Hialeah Assistant City Attorney)

- 1. Copy of 'Monthly Activity Report' for District 5 from January 2015 to January 2016.
- 2. Copy of Police Officer Job Description.
- 3. Copy of Written Counseling for Mr. Juan Iglesias dated August 16, 2014
- 4. Copy of Written Reprimand for Mr. Juan Iglesias dated December 15, 2014.
- 5. Copy of 10 hrs. Disciplinary Action for September 2015.
- 6. Copy of 20 hrs Disciplinary Action for October 2015.
- 7. Copy of HPD Budget Traffic Data.

At the conclusion of the testimony of the witnesses present and argument of counsel, the Personnel Board made the following motions:

Motion by Mr. Alvarez to deny the City's suspension recommendation. Motion died due to no second.

Motion by Mr. Carnevale to uphold the City's suspension recommendation. Motion died due to no second.

Motion made by Ms. Pena to reduce Officer Juan Iglesias suspension from 20 hour to 10 hours. Second by Mr. Dielmann Pena. Passed by 3-2 vote.

If any person decides to appeal any decision made by the Personnel Board with respect to any matter considered at this meeting, he/she will need a record of the proceedings and, for such purpose, may need to ensure that a verbatim record of the proceedings is made, which record includes the testimony and evidence upon which the appeal is to be based. In accordance with the Americans and Disabilities Act of 1990, persons needing a special accommodation to participate in this proceeding should contact the Office of the City Clerk no later than seven (7) days prior to the proceeding. Telephone (305) 883-5820 for assistance; if hearing impaired, telephone the Florida Relay Service Numbers (800) 955-8771 (TDD) OR (800) 955-8770 (VOICE), for assistance